

## Broad Integrative Knowledge (Literature Review) Assessment Data

*Blue* = Update every few years and/or when something changes that would impact the documents.

*Green* = Update annually

### Learning Outcome:

#### Broad Integrative Knowledge:

- Articulates how the field of study has developed in relation to other major domains of inquiry and practice.
- Designs and executes an applied, investigative or creative work that draws on the perspectives and methods of other fields of study and assesses the resulting advantages and challenges of including these perspectives and methods.
- Articulates and defends the significance and implications of the work in the primary field of study in terms of challenges and trends in a social or global context.

### Outcome Measure:

#### GED 689 Final Project

#### Criteria for Success (how do you judge if the students have met your standards):

Literature Review: Score of (3) out of possible (4) points on rubric.

#### Aligned with DQP Learning Areas (circle one or more but not all five):

1. Specialized Knowledge
2. **Broad Integrative Knowledge**
3. Intellectual Skills/Core Competencies
4. Applied and Collaborative Learning, and
5. Civic and Global Learning

### Longitudinal Data:

#### Mission Valley:

| 1 | MV 2015 - 2016 GED 689 W Data |  |                              |                   |                         |                       |                  |                    |
|---|-------------------------------|--|------------------------------|-------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------|------------------|--------------------|
| 2 | Group Name                    | Rubric Criteria                          | DRF Name                     | Authors evaluated | Average for Group (Raw) | Average for Group (%) | Median for Group | Standard Deviation |
| 3 | GED 689 Written               | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Counseling & Guidance   | 1                 | 4.00                    | 100                   | 4                | 0                  |
| 4 | GED 689 Written               | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Ed Leadership (1.31.12) | 0                 |                         |                       |                  |                    |
| 5 | GED 689 Written               | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Special Education       | 7                 | 4.00                    | 100                   | 4                | 0                  |
| 6 | GED 689 Written               | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Teaching and Learning   | 9                 | 3.78                    | 94.44                 | 4                | 0.44               |
| 7 | GED 689 Written               | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MAT - Multiple Subject       | 9                 | 3.94                    | 98.61                 | 4                | 0.17               |
| 8 | <b>Overall Average</b>        |  |                              |                   | <b>3.93</b>             | <b>97.68333333</b>    | <b>4</b>         | <b>0.61</b>        |
| 9 |                               |  |                              |                   | Out of 4.00             |                       |                  |                    |

**MV 2016 -2017 GED 689 W Data** ☆

File Edit View Insert Format Data Tools Add-ons Help [All changes saved in Drive](#)

| Group Name             | Rubric Criteria                          | DRF Name                     | Authors evaluated | Average for Group (Raw)   | Average for Group (%) | Median   | Standard Deviation for Group |
|------------------------|--|------------------------------|-------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------|----------|------------------------------|
| GED 689 Written        | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Counseling & Guidance   | 25                | 3.76/4                    | 94                    | 4        | 0.44                         |
| GED 689 Written        | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Ed Leadership (1.31.12) | 0                 |                           |                       |          |                              |
| GED 689 Written        | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Special Education       | 11                | 3.82/4                    | 95.45                 | 4        | 0.44                         |
| GED 689 Written        | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Teaching and Learning   | 14                | 3.84/4                    | 95.98                 | 4        | 0.38                         |
| GED 689 Written        | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MAT - Multiple Subject       | 16                | 3.63/4                    | 90.63                 | 4        | 0.49                         |
| <b>Overall Average</b> |  |                              |                   | <b>3.76 (out of 4.00)</b> | <b>94.015</b>         | <b>4</b> | <b>0.4375</b>                |

**MV 2017 -2018 GED 689 W Data** ☆

File Edit View Insert Format Data Tools Add-ons Help [All changes saved in Drive](#)

| Group Name             | Rubric Criteria                          | DRF Name                     | Authors evaluated | Average for Group (Raw)   | Average for Group (%) | Median for Group | Standard Deviation for Group |
|------------------------|--|------------------------------|-------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------|------------------|------------------------------|
| GED 689 Written        | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Counseling & Guidance   | 30                | 3.79/4                    | 94.67                 | 4                | 0.4                          |
| GED 689 Written        | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Ed Leadership (1.31.12) | 1                 | 4.00/4                    | 100                   | 4                | 0                            |
| GED 689 Written        | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Special Education       | 13                | 3.85/4                    | 96.15                 | 4                | 0.38                         |
| GED 689 Written        | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Teaching and Learning   | 16                | 3.62/4                    | 90.47                 | 3.95             | 0.46                         |
| GED 689 Written        | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MAT - Multiple Subject       | 14                | 3.79/4                    | 94.64                 | 4                | 0.37                         |
| <b>Overall Average</b> |  |                              |                   | <b>3.81 (out of 4.00)</b> | <b>95.186</b>         | <b>3.99</b>      | <b>0.322</b>                 |

**MV 2018 -2019 GED 689 W Data** ☆

File Edit View Insert Format Data Tools Add-ons Help [All changes saved in Drive](#)

| Group Name             | Rubric Criteria                          | DRF Name                     | Authors evaluated | Average for Group (Raw)   | Average for Group (%) | Median for Group | Standard Deviation for Group |
|------------------------|--|------------------------------|-------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------|------------------|------------------------------|
| GED 689 Written        | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Counseling & Guidance   | 24                | 3.54/4                    | 88.47                 | 3.64             | 0.46                         |
| GED 689 Written        | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Ed Leadership (1.31.12) | 0                 |                           |                       |                  |                              |
| GED 689 Written        | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Special Education       | 7                 | 3.50/4                    | 87.5                  | 3.7              | 0.41                         |
| GED 689 Written        | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Teaching and Learning   | 11                | 3.44/4                    | 85.91                 | 3.3              | 0.46                         |
| GED 689 Written        | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MAT - Multiple Subject       | 14                | 3.69/4                    | 92.23                 | 3.9              | 0.41                         |
| <b>Overall Average</b> |  |                              |                   | <b>3.54 (out of 4.00)</b> | <b>88.53</b>          | <b>3.64</b>      | <b>0.44</b>                  |

**Bakersfield:**

**BK 2015-2016 GED 689 W Data** ☆

File Edit View Insert Format Data Tools Add-ons Help [All changes saved in Drive](#)

| Group Name             | Rubric Criteria                          | DRF Name                     | Authors evaluate | Average for Group (Raw)   | Average for Group (%) | Median             | Standard Deviation |
|------------------------|--|------------------------------|------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------|--------------------|--------------------|
| GED 689 Written        | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Counseling & Guidance   | 0                |                           |                       |                    |                    |
| GED 689 Written        | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Ed Leadership (1.31.12) | 0                |                           |                       |                    |                    |
| GED 689 Written        | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Special Education       | 6                | 3.50/4                    | 87.5                  | 4                  | 0.84               |
| GED 689 Written        | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Teaching and Learning   | 9                | 3.67/4                    | 91.67                 | 4                  | 0.5                |
| GED 689 Written        | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MAT - Multiple Subject       | 4                | 3.50/4                    | 87.5                  | 3.5                | 0.58               |
| <b>Overall Average</b> |  |                              |                  | <b>3.55 (out of 4.00)</b> | <b>88.89</b>          | <b>3.833333333</b> | <b>0.64</b>        |

**BK 2016 -2017 GED 689 W Data** ☆

File Edit View Insert Format Data Tools Add-ons Help [All changes saved in Drive](#)

| Group Name             | Rubric Criteria                          | DRF Name                     | Authors evaluated | Average for Group (Raw)  | Average for Group (%) | Median   | Standard Deviation for Group |
|------------------------|--|------------------------------|-------------------|--------------------------|-----------------------|----------|------------------------------|
| GED 689 Written        | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Counseling & Guidance   | 0                 |                          |                       |          |                              |
| GED 689 Written        | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Ed Leadership (1.31.12) | 0                 |                          |                       |          |                              |
| GED 689 Written        | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Special Education       | 9                 | 3.67/4                   | 91.67                 | 4        | 0.5                          |
| GED 689 Written        | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Teaching and Learning   | 10                | 3.80/4                   | 95                    | 4        | 0.42                         |
| GED 689 Written        | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MAT - Multiple Subject       | 8                 | 3.63/4                   | 90.63                 | 4        | 0.52                         |
| <b>Overall Average</b> |  |                              |                   | <b>3.7 (out of 4.00)</b> | <b>92.43333333</b>    | <b>4</b> | <b>0.48</b>                  |

**BK 2017 -2018 GED 689 W Data** ☆ SHARE

File Edit View Insert Format Data Tools Add-ons Help [All changes saved in Drive](#)

| 1 | BK 2017 - 2018 GED 689 W Data |  |                              |                   |                           |                       |                  |                              |
|---|-------------------------------|--|------------------------------|-------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------|------------------|------------------------------|
| 2 | Group Name                    | Rubric Criteria                          | DRF Name                     | Authors evaluated | Average for Group (Raw)   | Average for Group (%) | Median for Group | Standard Deviation for Group |
| 3 | GED 689 Written               | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Counseling & Guidance   | 0                 |                           |                       |                  |                              |
| 4 | GED 689 Written               | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Ed Leadership (1.31.12) | 3                 | 3.83/4                    | 95.83                 | 4                | 0.29                         |
| 5 | GED 689 Written               | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Special Education       | 5                 | 3.80/4                    | 95                    | 4                | 0.45                         |
| 6 | GED 689 Written               | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Teaching and Learning   | 6                 | 3.67/4                    | 91.67                 | 4                | 0.52                         |
| 7 | GED 689 Written               | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MAT - Multiple Subject       | 7                 | 3.86/4                    | 96.43                 | 4                | 0.38                         |
| 8 | <b>Overall Average</b>        |  |                              |                   | <b>3.79 (out of 4.00)</b> | <b>94.7325</b>        | <b>4</b>         | <b>0.41</b>                  |

**BK 2018 -2019 GED 689 W Data** ☆ SHARE

File Edit View Insert Format Data Tools Add-ons Help [All changes saved in Drive](#)

| 1 | BK 2018 - 2019 GED 689 W Data |  |                              |                   |                           |                       |                  |                              |
|---|-------------------------------|--|------------------------------|-------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------|------------------|------------------------------|
| 2 | Group Name                    | Rubric Criteria                          | DRF Name                     | Authors evaluated | Average for Group (Raw)   | Average for Group (%) | Median for Group | Standard Deviation for Group |
| 3 | GED 689 Written               | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Counseling & Guidance   | 0                 |                           |                       |                  |                              |
| 4 | GED 689 Written               | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Ed Leadership (1.31.12) | 3                 | 4.00/4                    | 100                   | 4                | 0                            |
| 5 | GED 689 Written               | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Special Education       | 2                 | 4.00/4                    | 100                   | 4                | 0                            |
| 6 | GED 689 Written               | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Teaching and Learning   | 0                 |                           |                       |                  |                              |
| 7 | GED 689 Written               | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MAT - Multiple Subject       | 9                 | 3.89/4                    | 97.22                 | 4                | 0.33                         |
| 8 | <b>Overall Average</b>        |  |                              |                   | <b>3.96 (out of 4.00)</b> | <b>99.07</b>          | <b>4</b>         | <b>0.11</b>                  |

## Aggregated Data:

**2015 - 2016 GED 689 W Aggregated Data** ☆ SHARE

File Edit View Insert Format Data Tools Add-ons Help [All changes saved in Drive](#)

| 1  | 2015 - 2016 GED 689 W Aggregated Data |  |   |                   |                           |                       |              |                          |
|----|---------------------------------------|--|---|-------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------|--------------|--------------------------|
| 2  | Group Name                            | Rubric Criteria                          | DRF Name  | Authors evaluated | Average for Group (Raw)   | Average for Group (%) | Median       | Standard Devi. for Group |
| 3  | GED 689P Written                      | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Counseling & Guidance                            | 2                 | 4                         | 100                   | 4            | 0                        |
| 4  | GED 689P Written                      | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Special Education                                | 15                | 3.8                       | 95                    | 4            | 0.56                     |
| 5  | GED 689P Written                      | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Teaching and Learning                            | 18                | 3.72                      | 93.06                 | 4            | 0.46                     |
| 6  | GED 689P Written                      | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MAT - Multiple Subject                                | 15                | 3.83                      | 95.83                 | 4            | 0.36                     |
| 7  | GED 689P Written                      | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MAT - Single Subject (Rev. 8/2011)                    | 14                | 3.71                      | 92.86                 | 4            | 0.47                     |
| 8  | GED 689P Written                      | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MAT - SPED Intern Moderate/Severe (2.16.12)           | 1                 | 3                         | 75                    | 3            | 0                        |
| 9  | GED 689P Written                      | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MAT - SPED Traditional Mild/Moderate (Rev. 8.30.11)   | 8                 | 3.88                      | 96.88                 | 4            | 0.35                     |
| 10 | GED 689P Written                      | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MAT - SPED Traditional Moderate/Severe (Rev. 8.30.11) | 1                 | 4                         | 100                   | 4            | 0                        |
| 11 | <b>Overall Average</b>                |  |   |                   | <b>3.74 (out of 4.00)</b> | <b>93.57875</b>       | <b>3.875</b> | <b>0.275</b>             |

**2016 - 2017 GED 689 W Aggregated Data** ☆ SHARE

File Edit View Insert Format Data Tools Add-ons Help [All changes saved in Drive](#)

| 1 | 2016 - 2017 GED 689 W Aggregated Data |  |                              |                   |                           |                       |          |                          |
|---|---------------------------------------|--|------------------------------|-------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------|----------|--------------------------|
| 2 | Group Name                            | Rubric Criteria                          | Folio Area                   | Authors evaluated | Average for Group (Raw)   | Average for Group (%) | Median   | Standard Devi. for Group |
| 3 | GED 689 Written                       | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Counseling & Guidance   | 25                | 3.76/4                    | 94                    | 4        | 0.44                     |
| 4 | GED 689 Written                       | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Ed Leadership (1.31.12) | 0                 |                           |                       |          |                          |
| 5 | GED 689 Written                       | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Special Education       | 20                | 3.75/4                    | 93.75                 | 4        | 0.44                     |
| 6 | GED 689 Written                       | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Teaching and Learning   | 24                | 3.82/4                    | 95.57                 | 4        | 0.38                     |
| 7 | GED 689 Written                       | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MAT - Multiple Subject       | 25                | 3.64/4                    | 91                    | 4        | 0.49                     |
| 8 | <b>Overall Average</b>                |  |                              |                   | <b>3.74 (out of 4.00)</b> | <b>93.58</b>          | <b>4</b> | <b>0.4375</b>            |

**2017 - 2018 GED 689 W Aggregated Data** ☆ SHARE

File Edit View Insert Format Data Tools Add-ons Help [All changes saved in Drive](#)

| 1 | 2017 - 2018 GED 689 W Aggregated Data |  |                              |                   |                           |                       |          |                    |
|---|---------------------------------------|--|------------------------------|-------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------|----------|--------------------|
| 2 | Group Name                            | Rubric Criteria                          | Folio Area                   | Authors evaluated | Average for Group (Raw)   | Average for Group (%) | Median   | Standard Deviation |
| 3 | GED 689 Written                       | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Counseling & Guidance   | 30                | 3.79/4                    | 94.67                 | 4        | 0.4                |
| 4 | GED 689 Written                       | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Ed Leadership (1.31.12) | 4                 | 3.88/4                    | 96.88                 | 4        | 0.25               |
| 5 | GED 689 Written                       | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Special Education       | 18                | 3.83/4                    | 95.83                 | 4        | 0.38               |
| 6 | GED 689 Written                       | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Teaching and Learning   | 22                | 3.63/4                    | 90.8                  | 4        | 0.46               |
| 7 | GED 689 Written                       | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MAT - Multiple Subject       | 21                | 3.81/4                    | 95.24                 | 4        | 0.36               |
| 8 | <b>Overall Average</b>                |  |                              |                   | <b>3.78 (out of 4.00)</b> | <b>94.684</b>         | <b>4</b> | <b>0.37</b>        |

2018 - 2019 GED 689 W Aggregated Data

File Edit View Insert Format Data Tools Add-ons Help All changes saved in Drive

100% \$ % .00 123 Arial 10 B I U

|   | A                                     | B  | C                            | D                 | E                       | F                     | G      | H                  |
|---|---------------------------------------|--|------------------------------|-------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------|--------|--------------------|
| 1 | 2018 - 2019 GED 689 W Aggregated Data |  |                              |                   |                         |                       |        |                    |
| 2 | Group Name                            | Rubric Criteria                          | Folio Area                   | Authors evaluated | Average for Group (Raw) | Average for Group (%) | Median | Standard Deviation |
| 3 | GED 689 Written                       | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Counseling & Guidance   | 24                | 3.54/4                  | 88.47                 | 3.64   | 0.46               |
| 4 | GED 689 Written                       | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Ed Leadership (1.31.12) | 3                 | 4.00/4                  | 100                   | 4      | 0                  |
| 5 | GED 689 Written                       | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Special Education       | 9                 | 3.61/4                  | 90.28                 | 3.75   | 0.42               |
| 6 | GED 689 Written                       | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MA - Teaching and Learning   | 11                | 3.44/4                  | 85.91                 | 3.3    | 0.46               |
| 7 | GED 689 Written                       | (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | MAT - Multiple Subject       | 23                | 3.77/4                  | 94.18                 | 4      | 0.38               |
| 8 | Overall Average                       |  |                              |                   | 3.67 (out of 4.00)      | 91.77                 | 3.74   | 0.34               |

### Conclusions Drawn from Data:

Aggregated data suggests scores dropped slightly from 2017-18 levels but remain well above the Criteria for Success. 2018-19 candidates' Literature Reviews averaged 3.67 (out of 4.00) on a measure of overall quality. This score places them closer to the "Exceeds Standards" area of the rubric than to "Meets Standard".

It should be noted the 2018-19 aggregates scores are the lowest in the last four years. MV score decreases drive this change. Three of the four MV programs with scores in 2018-19 were below 90%. The marks the first time in the last four years a program average was below 90%.

### Changes to be Made Based on Data:

Responding to this data calls for learning whether the changes observed in the MV scores are a product of increased expectations, decreased performance or something else. Calibration work among the course instructors will help answer this question. Calibration meetings are scheduled for 9/7/19. Further, the foundational teaching on literature reviews takes place in GED689. This data will be shared with those instructors to ensure alignment between those that do the initial instruction and those that support students' applied work on the literature review.

### Rubric Used

#### GED 689P Written Product

Created with W

|  | Far Below Standard  | Below Standard   | Meets Standard  | Exceeds Standard   |
|--|---|--|---|--|
| Literature Review (Broad and Integrative Knowledge, DQP 2) | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Few or no citations</li> <li>Less than 10 total sources</li> <li>Citations are not in the proper format</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>3 recent sources cited</li> <li>At least 10 total sources</li> <li>Some are relevant and credible</li> <li>Some citations are correctly made according to APA format</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>3 to 5 recent sources cited</li> <li>At least 20 total sources</li> <li>Most sources are relevant and credible</li> <li>Most citations are correctly made according to APA format</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>5 or more recent (5 years) sources cited</li> <li>At least 20 total sources</li> <li>All sources are relevant and credible</li> <li>All citations are correctly made according to APA format</li> </ul> |

## Assessment Data Sample

### Learning Outcome:

Mathematics Outcome #2: Students will be able to write proofs

### Outcome Measure:

MTH242 Signature Assignment (each year)

### Criteria for Success:

80% of the students to score a 2.5 or higher (on a scale of 1-4 with 1 being low) in each of the four areas:

- Statement of the problem
- Logic
- Symbolism
- Justification

### Aligned with DQP Learning Areas (circle one or more but not all five):

1. Specialized Knowledge
2. Broad Integrative Knowledge
3. Intellectual Skills/Core Competencies
4. Applied and Collaborative Learning, and
5. Civic and Global Learning

### Longitudinal Data:

|                      | Percentage of Class at 2.5 or Higher |      |      |      |
|----------------------|--------------------------------------|------|------|------|
|                      | 2011                                 | 2012 | 2013 | 2014 |
| Statement of Problem | 100%                                 | 100% | 100% | 100% |
| Logic                | 100%                                 | 88%  | 100% | 100% |
| Symbolism            | 100%                                 | 100% | 100% | 100% |
| Justification        | 86%                                  | 75%  | 100% | 83%  |

### Conclusions Drawn from Data:

The one point of weakness seems to be in the area of the justification of the steps of the proof.

### Changes to be Made Based on Data:

Continue to emphasize the fundamental importance of the need to justify each step of the proof in MTH242 and use this rubric to assess some of the early proof assignments in the class so that students have a clear indication that their lack of justification is weak point.

## Rubric Used

### Proof Writing Rubric (MTH242, MTH424, MTH444)

|                          | Unsatisfactory  | Low Satisfactory   | High Satisfactory   | Outstanding  |
|--------------------------|---|--|---|--|
| Statement of the Problem | Can not determine what is given and what needs to be proved | Misses one part of the hypothesis or the conclusion                        | Makes one minor error in identifying hypothesis or conclusion                       | Understands what is given and what is to be proved                               |
| Logic                    | Proof has major flaws that make it invalid.                 | Proof misses more than one major element.                                  | Proof has the main flow of the logic correct but misses one major element           | Statements flow logically from one another                                       |
| Symbolism                | There are many errors in the use of symbolic notation       | There are more than two errors in symbolic notation                        | There are two or fewer minor errors in symbolic notation (e.g. missing parentheses) | All symbols are used correctly   |
| Justification            | There are several errors in the justification               | There is one major mistake in justification or more than two minor errors. | There are two or fewer minor errors in justification for the steps.                 | Every logical step has the appropriate reason (theorem, definition, lemma, etc.) |